



OPEN **BUFFALO**

THE BUFFALO NIAGARA MEDICAL CAMPUS:

A High Road Strategy to Maximize the
Community's Benefit

AUGUST 2013

An Open Buffalo Report

By Sam Magavern with Alexis Leonard, Cornell ILR, High Road Fellow

Prepared by the Partnership for the Public Good

Open Buffalo is a civic initiative funded by the Open Society Foundations

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The Buffalo Niagara Medical Campus (“BNMC”) has become a major hub for private and public investment in Buffalo, an anchor institution that can help improve the quality of life for the whole region. Strategies to maximize the ways that the community benefits from the BNMC development include:

- Buying goods and services from locally-owned, independent companies, including minority-owned and worker-owned companies;
- Focusing economic development incentives and subsidies on the creation of new jobs, rather than the movement of jobs from one location to another or from one local competitor to another;
- Ensuring job quality with career advancement opportunities and living wages;
- Targeting employment opportunities to local residents through first source hiring policies;
- Building on neighborhood assets, particularly in the Fruit Belt, to help residents meet their goals in areas such as health, housing, education, and safety;
- Implementing an housing program that helps employees and other Fruit Belt residents buy and repair homes;
- Greening the campus with energy-efficient buildings, renewable energy usage, stormwater management, vigorous recycling and composting, and policies to support biking, walking, and public transit.

By adopting these strategies, the BNMC can become a major force in Buffalo’s revitalization.

INTRODUCTION

Buffalo’s The Buffalo Niagara Medical Campus is a consortium of premier health care, life sciences, medical education institutions and community interests located in downtown Buffalo.¹ Created in 2001, the BNMC’s member institutions include:

- The Buffalo Hearing and Speech Center
- Buffalo Medical Group, P.C.,
- The Center for Hospice & Palliative Care
- Hauptman-Woodward Medical Research Institute
- Kaleida Health
- Olmsted Center for Sight
- Roswell Park Cancer Institute



- University at Buffalo, and
- Upstate New York Transplant Services (UNYTS)

The BNMC is rapidly developing and expanding, and has grown from 7,000 employees in 2003 to more than 12,000 employees in 2012, with an expected 17,000 jobs by 2017.² The idea behind the BNMC is to create a conglomeration of health care, life sciences, medical

The BNMC will host an expected 17,000 jobs by 2017.

education institutions, and community interests downtown. The BNMC is also part of UB 2020 vision, which aims to relocate the Medical School, Nursing School, School of Public Health, Dentistry School, and Pharmacy School into an Academic Health Center.

BUYING FROM LOCAL BUSINESSES

The BNMC and its member institutions buy a large amount of goods and services each year. One of the BNMC’s most powerful tools in benefiting the community is to buy as much as possible from local, independent businesses. Many economic multiplier studies have shown that when a person shops at a local independent business, versus a nationally-owned corporation, between 3 and 3.5 times more of the money spent is re-spent in that locality, thus helping to grow vibrant local economies and strengthen communities. The profits of a local business owner are often used to purchase more local products, pay rent to a local property owner, bank at a local bank, pay local employees, pay local taxes, and make contributions to local charities. The BNMC should help its members to adopt a campus-wide “buy local” policy and to evaluate all of the goods and services purchased to see which could be sourced locally, with a particular emphasis on minority and women-owned businesses.

One of the most talked-about innovations in the nation is the Evergreen Cooperative in Cleveland, which is based on a vision of “community wealth building.”³ Created by public and private organizations like the City of Cleveland, the Ohio Employee Ownership Clinic at Kent State, Case Western Reserve, the Cleveland Clinic, and University Hospitals, Evergreen is a worker-owned cooperative consisting of several sustainable businesses, including a green industrial laundry system and a solar panel installation company.

Evergreen’s goals are:

- Leveraging a portion of the multi-billion dollar annual business expenditures of anchor institutions into the surrounding neighborhoods;
- Establishing a robust network of Evergreen Cooperative enterprises based on community wealth



building models to service these institutional needs;

- Creating environmentally sustainable energy jobs and supporting support area anchor institutions in achieving their own environmental goals;
- Linking the entire effort to expanding sectors of the economy (e.g., health care, our aging population, local food, and sustainable energy), many of which are recipients of large-scale public investment.
- Developing the financing and management capacities that can take this effort to scale to have significant municipal impact.⁴

Over the next five years, Evergreen aims to catalyze the creation of up to 10 new for-profit, worker-owned cooperatives based in the Greater University Circle area of Cleveland. Together, these 10 businesses will employ approximately 500 residents of six low-income neighborhoods. Evergreen’s financial projections indicate that after approximately 8 years, a typical Evergreen worker-owner will possess an equity stake in their company of about \$65,000.⁵ Their longer-term objective is to produce 5,000 new direct jobs for Clevelanders over the next 10 to 15 years.⁶ The BNMC should look carefully at the Evergreen model and evaluate what types of worker-owned businesses might thrive in its environs, looking at areas such as laundry, food service, landscaping, janitorial, etc.

EVERGREEN HOPES TO CREATE 5,000
NEW JOBS IN THE NEXT 10-15 YEARS

MAKING THE MOST OF BNMC'S EMPLOYMENT POTENTIAL

Distinguishing New Jobs from Old

When analyzing job creation at the BNMC, one must distinguish between different types of “new” jobs at the site. These include:

- **Relocation of existing jobs.** If an existing employer moves to the BNMC or shifts employees from another location to the BNMC, those jobs are new to the BNMC but not to the local economy.
- **Jobs that are new to the employer but not to the local economy.** For example, if an employer hires an additional practicing physician on the campus, there is probably no net gain to Buffalo’s economy, as doctors compete for a finite pool of local customers rather than exporting goods or services beyond the region.
- **Jobs that are “imported” from another state or country.** For example, when Cleveland BioLabs



brought employees to the campus from their previous home in Ohio, the company created “new” jobs that resulted in a net gain to Buffalo’s economy because the positions came from out of the region. The result may be a zero sum gain from a national point of view, but it is a “new” job for Buffalo.

- ***Jobs that did not exist in the past.*** If an innovative start-up company at the campus offers an employment opportunity based on a new idea or technique, especially if it involves selling to customers from outside the region, that may represent the “newest” of new jobs and the most likely to add to our local and national economy.

Most of the jobs being added at the BNMC fall within the first two categories and do not offer a net gain to the local Buffalo economy. New jobs are not the only reason for the public to invest in the BNMC. Health and education are public goods that justify substantial public investment. And relocating jobs to the BNMC, especially from suburban locations, has many benefits. But when the public invests in the BNMC in the name of job creation (for example, with tax exemptions granted by the Erie County Industrial Development Agency), it is important to distinguish jobs that are new only to the BNMC from jobs that are new to the local economy.

MOST OF THE JOBS BEING ADDED AT THE BNMC ARE THE RESULT OF RELOCATION OR INVOLVE COMPETITION FOR A FINITE POOL OF LOCAL CUSTOMERS; THEY ARE NOT NET GAINS TO THE LOCAL

Making Low-Skill Jobs Rewarding

Although the “Eds and Meds” sector offers many high-skill, high-paying jobs, it is important to remember that many of the jobs at the BNMC are lower skill, lower paying jobs. If the BNMC is to offer high road economic development, jobs must be made available to nearby residents, must pay enough to keep workers out of poverty, and must offer paths for advancement.

One way to ensure that BNMC employers help lift workers out of poverty and prevent exploitation is to adopt a living wage policy. With some exceptions, the minimum wage rate in New York State is currently \$7.25 per hour.⁷ The 2013 State budget calls for this minimum wage to be raised to \$9 per hour by 2015.⁸ Even at \$9 per hour, however, the minimum wage will not suffice to keep a family out of poverty. As a result, many full time workers and their children will live in poverty and will depend on public assistance to supplement inadequate wages.



| Job | Mean Annual Wage for this Job Category in Western New York⁹ |
|---|---|
| Transportation and Parking <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Parking lot attendants ▪ Shuttle bus drivers | \$18,330 \$27,080 |
| Janitorial and Maintenance <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Janitors/cleaners ▪ Groundskeepers | \$25,240 \$27,990 |
| Food Preparation & Service <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Food preparation workers ▪ Food preparation/serving ▪ Counter attendants ▪ Cafeteria attendants | \$21,110 \$18,040 \$17,630 \$18,000 |
| Retail <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Salespersons ▪ Cashiers | \$23,860 \$19,140 |
| Office <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Receptionists ▪ File clerks ▪ Hotel desk clerks ▪ Library assistants | \$25,930 \$25,530 \$21,330 \$27,170 |
| Security <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Security guards | \$27,300 |
| Medical <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Nursing assistants ▪ Orderlies ▪ Pharmacy aides | \$27,320 \$25,440 \$22,540 |

To help fill this gap, over 150 cities, towns, school boards, and other entities have passed living wage laws. Buffalo’s Living Wage Ordinance covers city workers and the workers at companies with over 10 employees that pay or receive more than \$50,000 per year from the City. The current living wage rate in Buffalo is \$12.40 per hour for workers without benefits and \$11.05 for workers with benefits¹⁰.

The BNMC may wish to adopt a living wage policy based on the City’s Living Wage Ordinance. An example of such a policy can be found at HarborCenter, the new development being built across from the First Niagara Center. As part of its agreement with the City, HarborCenter agreed to pay its parking ramp and ice rink employees a living wage.¹¹ The BNMC employers could similarly agree to make the BNMC a “living wage” campus where all employees would receive a living wage as defined by the City Ordinance.

THE CURRENT LIVING WAGE RATE IN BUFFALO IS \$12.40/HR FOR EMPLOYEES WHO DO NOT RECEIVE HEALTH BENEFITS



In addition to reducing poverty and the use of public assistance, living wages can reduce employee turnover and lead to higher morale and productivity. Another compelling reason for the BNMC employers to pay a living wage is to fulfill their mission of improving health. Decades of research has shown that poverty is one of the most important contributors to poor health outcomes.¹² As one survey of the research summarizes it, “there is a very clear and very robust relationship between individual income and individual health. That is, poverty leads to lower health status.”¹³ In keeping with the Hippocratic Oath, BNMC employers should not harm the health of employees by paying poverty-level wages.

Pathways to Jobs and Career Ladders

Various efforts are being made to create pathways to BNMC jobs for local and disadvantaged residents. One important example is the Health Sciences Charter School (HSCS), located near the BNMC at 1140 Ellicott Street. HSCS is a regional charter school that opened in 2010, with students coming from over ten different districts in the Buffalo Niagara region, and the greatest number coming from low-income neighborhoods in Buffalo.¹⁴ HSCS’s location facilitates placing students in internships and provides for “easy access for students to field trips, mentoring, real-work internships and service learning placements at partner facilities.”¹⁵

Another example is the Buffalo Arts and Technology Center (BATC) opening in the ArtSpace building at 1219 Main St., also near the BNMC. Modeled after the Manchester Bidwell Corp. in Pittsburgh, BATC will provide arts education for at-risk high school students while also providing job training to traditionally unemployed or underserved residents aimed at helping them get jobs as medical coders and pharmacy techs at the BNMC.

The BNMC currently uses two specialized employment programs. The first program hires employees through Good Will to do landscaping and grounds keeping work on the campus.¹⁶ These employees work 45 hours per week and learn a new skill set for 10 hours each week.¹⁷ The second program works with the Center for Employment Opportunities to provide newly released convicts with temporary work and an opportunity to earn an income starting the first day they are released.¹⁸

There are many reasons for the BNMC to hire workers who live near the campus: to support local residents; to improve the neighborhood; and to reduce the need for parking lots and reduce pollution by hiring people who can walk, bike, or use public transit to get to work. The BNMC and its members should explore a first source hiring program in which

THE BNMC AND ITS MEMBERS SHOULD
EXPLORE A FIRST SOURCE HIRING
PROGRAM IN WHICH RESIDENTS OF
SPECIFIC ZIP CODES WOULD HAVE THE
FIRST SHOT AT HIRING



residents of specified zip codes would have the first shot at job openings. First Source programs around the country have helped employers by creating pools of qualified, interested workers and helped employees get jobs near to where they live. The New York State Department of Labor can help to create a first source program at the BNMC.

Once hired, employees need career ladders to avoid getting stuck in lower skill, lower paid jobs. Places such as Boston’s Healthcare Training Institute, which seeks to reduce turnover and enhance skills to increase opportunities for advancement at health care and research institutions, offer innovative methods for creating such opportunities.¹⁹

BUILDING ON NEIGHBORHOOD ASSETS

Only a few years ago, the BNMC board of directors took a narrow view of its mission that largely ended at campus borders. Since then, however, the board has adopted a much more expansive view in which fighting poverty and aiding in neighborhood redevelopment are core concerns.

The Fruit Belt lies directly east of the BNMC, and is contained by North Street on the northern edge, Jefferson street on the eastern edge, the 33 Kensington Expressway in the south, and Michigan Avenue on the west.²⁰ Historically the neighborhood was much larger, encompassing the area where the BNMC is now located, and stretching from Main St in the West to Best St in the North, and Genesee St. in the East. However, construction of the Kensington Expressway, the BNMC, and other developments has created barriers and made the neighborhood smaller and more isolated.²¹ Established in 1839, and originally planted with many orchards and fruit trees, the Fruit Belt became a predominantly African American community around 1970. By 2000, the percent of the Fruit Belt population living in poverty increased to 45% and overall population decreased to about 3000.²² In 2009 the population dropped to below 2000, with an average income of \$23,000 – less than half of the metropolitan area’s median income.²³

In attempting to aid Fruit Belt residents, the BNMC should consider the approach of Asset Based Community Development (ABCD), which begins with strengths rather than perceived deficits or problems.

ASSET BASED COMMUNITY
DEVELOPMENT (ABCD) BEGINS WITH
STRENGTHS INSTEAD OF PERCEIVED
DEFIETS OR PROBLEMS

The Fruit Belt has many assets, including historic architecture, active churches, block clubs and non-profits, community gardens, schools, and businesses. A survey of assets can be found in Vera Neroni’s fact sheet, “Potential for Revitalization of Fruit Belt Neighborhood as a Result of BNMC Development,”

available at <http://bflo-poverty.wikispaces.com/The+Buffalo+Niagara+Medical+Campus+and+Poverty>.



Healthy Neighborhoods

One natural way for the BNMC to aid the Fruit Belt would be to focus on its residents' health by offering free and low cost medical services, nutrition programs, recreation and exercise programs, etc. Recently, the BNMC was awarded a *Healthy Kids, Healthy Communities* grant through the Robert Wood Johnson Foundation to engage the Buffalo community in healthy eating, active living, and improved food access.²⁴ This could be beneficial for the Fruit Belt, which currently has limited access to food.²⁵ There are no grocery stores within the Fruit Belt neighborhood, and residents must rely on convenience stores. One simple idea would be for the BNMC to help the neighborhood to plant and maintain fruit trees to provide low-cost, fresh, and truly local fruit to the residents of the Fruit Belt.

THERE ARE NO GROCERY STORE IN THE
FRUIT BELT NEIGHBORHOOD

Housing

Another way to help create a stronger and more sustainable neighborhood is to encourage BNMC workers to live close enough to walk or bike to work. Encouraging quality, affordable employee housing has many benefits, including:

- Reducing the need for driving and parking at the campus, which is expensive and environmentally harmful, especially to nearby residents who must breathe the cars' fumes.
- Restoring density to the Fruit Belt, which has lost much of its population and, as a consequence, is plagued by vacant buildings, vacant lots, and inadequate opportunities for retail businesses.²⁶

A BNMC employee housing program should be geared towards employees of the Buffalo Niagara Medical Campus who purchase a home in the Fruit Belt. To avoid problems of gentrification, the program should focus on aiding lower wage workers at the BNMC already renting in the Fruit Belt to buy their own homes. Under the plan, eligible employees would be guaranteed a percentage of their mortgage, down payment, closing costs, and rehabilitation costs, if needed. The BNMC should also provide support to local housing programs that aid Fruit Belt residents in repairing their homes, regardless of employment at the BNMC.

Examples of employee housing programs include:

- The University of Southern California Neighborhood Housing Program (NHP). This program is available to employees as an incentive to purchase, invest, and live in homes in the surrounding communities. The NHP provides participants with monthly payments totaling \$50,000 or 20% of the home purchase price over seven years.²⁷



- The Yale Homebuyer Program. This program has over 1,000 participants and has helped revitalize downtown New Haven. An applicant is awarded a grant of \$30,000 over ten years with \$7,500 distributed in the first year and \$2,500 every year thereafter. Participants who choose to live in the less popular surrounding neighborhoods are given an additional \$5,000. The program also offers homeownership, lending, and financing classes to participants. The Homebuyer Program costs Yale roughly \$1.1 million each year, but the return on their investment has led to a safer community, happier employees, a more marketable school and campus, and a healthier relationship between the city and university.²⁸
- Johns Hopkins ‘Live Near Your Work’ Program: This program has helped over 450 Johns Hopkins employees buy a home. This model has driven down commute time, alleviated parking problems, allowed employees to build home equity, and curbed blight in some of Baltimore’s neighborhoods. Through a partnership with a charitable foundation, the City of Baltimore, and the State of Maryland, employees are entitled to home ownership grants that range from \$6,000 to \$17,000 depending on the neighborhood range and proximity to the campus.²⁹

BNMC PAID MORE THAN 18,000 PER PARKING SPOT TO BUILD ITS NEW PARKING RAMP

SUSTAINABILITY

One of the greatest hurdles facing the BNMC growth plan is commuter parking. Today, 93% of employees drive to work, with four out of five driving alone.³ The campus has just finished building the largest parking garage in Buffalo. It cost \$34 million and has around 1,800 parking spaces.⁴ Yet, under the current growth plan, the campus foresees a net deficit of nearly 3,000 spaces.⁶ More parking garages will not be a solution. Not only is the cost prohibitive, but space is limited. Furthermore, the highway infrastructure cannot withstand another few thousand cars at peak commute times. Therefore, the BNMC is actively pursuing programs that bring fewer cars to the campus. These include increasing accessibility and convenience of public transit and incentivizing biking, walking, and carpooling.

BNMC should also discourage driving by making parking more expensive than it is now and using the increased revenue to make biking, walking, and public transit easier and cheaper (for example, with employee discounts on bus passes). Setting aside premium rows of parking spaces for carpoolers makes it harder for the single commuter and brings fewer cars per person to campus. The campus can also create a forum for carpoolers to connect.⁸ Car owners would connect with non-car owner employees. This provides benefits for both parties. The driver gets access to ample premium parking and the other carpooler gets a



lift to work. This may be particularly advantageous for low wage workers, many of whom do not own a car.

Another option to entice commuters onto the train would be to reduce fare costs. BNMC could negotiate with the NFTA to provide all employees with free or reduced fare. In the past, the University at Buffalo, a BNMC member, has negotiated free fare for students using the rail.¹⁵ The rail line is underutilized and operates at a loss. Adding riders at a reduced fare will bring in more revenue and will maximize utility of the line. If the campus provided subway fare for any employee that desired, it would cost \$900 per year per employee. Though it may sound expensive, BNMC paid more than \$18,000 per parking spot to build its new parking ramp. That is 20 years' worth of subway fare for a single commuter employee.

BNMC should work with the NFTA to devise bus routes that cut directly through the densest areas of the campus. For instance, there is no bus route in the campus section of Michigan Ave.¹⁸ However, High Street is major transportation corridor for bus transit.¹⁹ If some of the bus lines along High street were altered to head north-south on Michigan Ave., then workers could be dropped off closer to where they work. Alternatively, the campus could lobby the NFTA to create a commuter bus line that mimics the school bus line 111-Michigan South line, but that operates outside of school hours. The current extra hike from the closest bus stop to campus buildings makes bussing less attractive to commuters, particularly in inclement weather.

ONLY 1 OUT OF EVERY 100 BNMC
EMPLOYEES WALK OR BIKE TO WORK

Walking and biking reduce pollution and have significant health benefits.²⁰ Yet currently only one out of one hundred BNMC employees walk or bike to the campus.²¹ BNMC should partner with the city to make streets more attractive to walkers and bikers, with, for example, bike lanes that feed directly into the campus. In many instances, adding a bike lane is as easy as eliminating parking on one side of the street and painting a few extra lines.²³ Similarly, walkers are more attracted to well-maintained streets. Providing even sidewalks with elegant landscaping makes a walker's commute more enjoyable.²⁴ (The campus is considering extending a pedestrian walkway east of the Allen Medical subway station).²⁵ Bike racks and storage should be widespread and in easily accessible locations. Covered walk ways and public umbrellas would help walkers get to and from work in bad weather. BNMC has partnered with Buffalo Bike share to provide bikes to those without one.²⁶ This is particularly useful for employees who take public transport but need a form of personal transport for quick trips during the day.

To the extent that additional parking is required, the BNMC should explore supporting a neighborhood-owned parking operation, the proceeds of which would be used to fund community projects in the Fruit Belt. Because Fruit Belt residents endure many negative impacts from BNMC employees parking on their



streets, it is important that some offsetting benefits from parking be created.

The BNMC should also make sure that its buildings' design and operations are as green as possible. As PPG reports in *Greening Buffalo: What Local Governments Can Do*, buildings account for 48% of the nation's energy consumption.³⁰ In Buffalo, residential buildings account for 34% of the city's greenhouse gas emissions, and commercial establishments account for 20%.³¹ If current global warming trends continue, by 2100 Buffalo can expect to have 48 days over 90 degrees each year, and 14 days over 100 degrees. Among other things, the increased heat and lower air quality will have dramatic negative effects on Buffalo residents' health, especially in low-income neighborhoods such as the Fruit Belt.

Building green, particularly in the area of energy efficiency, can require a small additional investment upfront, but that investment is quickly repaid by energy savings. Buffalo's HealthNow building, which is certified LEED Silver, incurred 1 to 2% extra in initial costs, but is saving owners some \$166,000 per year in energy costs.³² One way to ensure green buildings is to require a certain level of LEED certification. Effective policies require at least LEED Silver and certification at anything less than Silver is, unfortunately, relatively meaningless. Even LEED Silver status does not guarantee that the building will be energy efficient, which is the most important green criterion, because buildings can earn points in many other ways. Thus, it is wise to require an Energy Star designation as well (Energy Star is the federal government's designation for buildings that score in the top 25% for energy efficiency).

BUFFALO'S HEALTHNOW BUILDING,
WHICH IS CERTIFIED LEED SILVER,
INCURRED 1 TO 2% IN EXTRA COSTS
UPFRONT, BUT IS SAVING OWNERS
\$166,000 PER YEAR IN UTILITY BILLS

Operation is as important as design, and one important area of operation is waste management. The BNMC should be a model for waste reduction, recycling, and composting. With its large food service operation and its interest in nutrition, the BNMC could compost all of its food scraps and use them in community gardening and fruit tree projects.

The BNMC should also be a leader in water conservation and management of storm water. Like other old cities, Buffalo has a combined storm and sanitary sewer system, with the result that, when it rains, the amount of water in the system overwhelms the limited capacity of the treatment plants and raw sewage and other pollutants flow directly into our waterways. BNMC design requirements should include a rule that all development on the site (buildings and parking areas) include aggressive water conservation and measures to keep storm water out of the sewers through rain gardens, green roofs, landscaping, tree plantings, and rain barrels. No buildings should have downspouts or other systems that send storm water directly from roofs into the sewers.



CONCLUSION

The rapid growth of the Buffalo Niagara Medical Campus in the past few years has led to a host of opportunities. The BNMC can help itself and its region by focusing on high road economic development principles, including local businesses, quality jobs, and environmental sustainability. As a health complex, the BNMC should take a keen interest in the health of its neighbors, and reducing poverty, inequality, and pollution can do more for health outcomes than even the most miraculous medicines and technologies.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This report was researched and drafted by the students in a class titled *Fighting Poverty in Buffalo* at the SUNY Buffalo Law School: Gabriella Agonstinelli, Lee Bender, Dan Corbitt, Amanda Dermady, Adam Faeth, Nick Fischer, Jessica Fitzpatrick, Nikki Intschert, Brad Loliger, Katie Martin, Billy Miller, and Vera Neroni. It was edited by Sam Magavern, instructor at SUNY Buffalo Law School and co-director at the Partnership for the Public Good, with the assistance of Cornell University ILR School High Road Fellow Alexis Leonard. Special thanks to Patrick Whelan, Holly Hutchinson, and Ekua Mends-Aidoo from the BNMC for meeting with us and sharing their time and insights.

Open Buffalo is a civic initiative of the Coalition for Economic Justice, the Partnership for the Public Good, PUSH Buffalo, and VOICE-Buffalo funded by the Open Society Foundations.



¹ Buffalo Niagara Medical Campus, Master Plan Update at iii (December 2010), available online at http://www.bnmc.org/wp-content/uploads/BNMC-Master-Plan-Update-FINAL_12-3-10.pdf.

² See Buffalo Niagara Medical Campus, Master Plan Update, *supra* note 1, at 2; Buffalo Niagara Medical Campus: About, available online at <http://www.bnmc.org/about/>.

³ <http://evergreencooperatives.com/about/mission-goals-and-principles/>, March 22, 2013

⁴Id.

⁵ Id.

⁶ Id.

⁷ Salaries listed are the mean annual wage in the Buffalo-Niagara Falls, New York area, calculated by the United States Department of Labor, Bureau of Labor Statistics. See May 2012 Metropolitan and Nonmetropolitan Area Occupational Employment and Wage Estimates, available online at http://www.bls.gov/oes/current/oes_15380.htm (see Occupation code 53-6021 for parking lot attendants; 53-3031 for shuttle bus drivers; 37-2011 for janitors and cleaners; 37-3011 for landscaping and groundskeeping workers; 35-2021 for food preparation workers; 35-3021 for combined food preparation and serving workers; 35-3022 for counter attendants; 35-9011 for cafeteria attendants; 41-2031 for retail salespersons; 41-2011 for cashiers; 43-4171 for receptionists and information clerks; 43-4071 for file clerks; 43-4081 for hotel desk clerks; 43-4121 for library assistants; 33-9032 for security guards; 31-1014 for nursing assistants; 31-1015 for orderlies; 31-9095 for pharmacy aides; and 29-2041 for emergency medical technicians and paramedics).

⁸ New York State Department of Labor. Labor Standards – Minimum Wages.

http://www.labor.state.ny.us/workerprotection/laborstandards/workprot/minwage.shtm#MIN_WAGE_LAW_S

⁹ Edward Krudy, *Reuters*. “New York budget deal includes minimum wage hike, tax breaks.”

<http://www.reuters.com/article/2013/03/21/us-usa-newyork-budget-idUSBRE92K0TC20130321>

¹⁰ Personal Email Communication with Sam Magavern, 3/28/2013, and Social Security Cost of Living Adjustment <http://www.ssa.gov/cola>

¹¹ The Canalside Community Alliance (CSCA), led by the Coalition for Economic Justice, has spearheaded calls for living wages, quality jobs, and other community benefits in the Canalside development being done by the City and by the Erie Canal Harbor Development Corporation (ECHDC). The CSCA and ECHDC appear to be on the verge of an agreement regarding community benefits that would also include living wage provisions.

¹² University of Wisconsin-Madison Institute for Research on Poverty. *Health & Poverty*.

<http://www.irp.wisc.edu/research/health.htm>



¹³ Shelley Phipps, “The Impact of Poverty on Health: a Scan of Research Literature.” Canadian Institute for Health Information, June 2003.

¹⁴ Partnership for the Public Good, “The Public Good,” radio program interviewing Hank Stopinski and Michelle Lim of the Health Sciences Charter School, July 17, 2012, available at <http://archive.org/details/ThePublicGood>.

¹⁵ Buffalo as an Architectural Museum, “The Health Sciences Charter School Opens 2011-12 Year in Architecturally Significant New Location in Buffalo,” available at <http://www.buffaloah.com/a/ellicott/1140/charterhist.html>.

¹⁶ Personal communication, Patrick Whalen, Chief Operating Officer of the Buffalo Niagara Medical Campus, March 29, 2013.

¹⁷ *Id.*

¹⁸ *Id.*

¹⁹ SkillWorks, Linking the Neighborhood to World Class Employers: A Profile of the Boston Health Care and Research Training Institute, March 2007, P. 1,

<http://nfw-solutions.org/sites/nfw-solutions.org/files/publications/HCRTI.pdf> (“Profile”).

²⁰ Strategy at 5

²¹ Conversation with Professor Taylor

²² Historical overview of blacks in fruit belt, pg 2

²³ Strategy at 4

²⁴ <http://www.bnmc.org/healthy-communities/healthy-kids-healthy-communities/>

²⁵ Dr. Samina Raja, Department of Urban and Regional Planning, School of Architecture and Planning, University at Buffalo, The State University of New York, email correspondence 3/28/2013

²⁶ Taylor, Henry Louis Jr. July 1, 2009. [A Historical View of Blacks in the Fruit Belt: The Continuing Struggle to Build A Vibrant Community](#). University at Buffalo Center for Urban Studies, School of Architecture and Planning.

²⁷ USC Neighborhood Homeownership Program. <http://re.usc.edu/housing/nhp/>

²⁸ “Working with the City, One Home at a Time.” <http://yaledailynews.com/blog/2010/09/29/working-with-the-city-one-home-at-a-time/>

²⁹ “Johns Hopkins Boosts Live Near Your Work Home-Buying Benefits”

<http://releases.jhu.edu/2011/04/12/johns-hopkins-live-near-your-work/>

³⁰ Sam Magavern, *Greening Buffalo: What Local Governments Can Do* (Partnership for the Public Good, 2008), p. 41, available at www.ppgbuffalo.org.

³¹ City of Buffalo Comprehensive Plan, p. 40; and Sam Magavern, *Affordable Housing and the Environment in Buffalo, New York* (Partnership for the Public Good, 2007), p. 26, available at



www.ppgbuffalo.org.

³² James Heaney, "Developers here slow to adapt," *Buffalo News*, 4/13/08.



